ISEJ Indonesian Science Education Journal

ISSN Online: 2716-3350
https://siducat.org/index.php/isej/
Published by Yayasan Darussalam Bengkulu

Online Collaborative Learning With Deep Learning In Fostering Critical Thinking And Motivation: Meta Synthetic Analysis

Novarita Novarita[1,2], Abdurrahman Abdurrrahman[1], Cucu Sutarsyah[1], Budi Kadaryanto[1], Bambang Setiyadi[1]
Doctoral Education Study Program, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Lampung, Indonesia[1,2]
Doctoral Education Study Program, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Baturaja, Indonesia[2]
E-mail Corresponding: novaritazkia@yahoo.com

Received: January 26, 2026	Revised: April 23, 2026	Accepted: May 25, 2026

Abstract

Online learning has expanded rapidly, yet many digital courses still struggle to cultivate sustained motivation and higher-order thinking because interaction is often limited to content delivery, fragmented discussion, or individual task completion. This article develops an integrative meta-synthesis on how Online Collaborative Learning (OCL), when supported by deep-learning-enabled artificial intelligence (AI), can strengthen critical thinking and learner motivation in higher education. The review synthesizes theoretical and empirical literature on OCL, computer-supported collaborative learning, learning analytics, adaptive feedback, and self-determination theory. Rather than treating AI as a replacement for pedagogy, this article conceptualizes deep learning as an adaptive scaffolding layer that can support peer dialogue, feedback, grouping, early-warning signals, and personalized learning paths. The synthesis identifies four mechanisms through which OCL-AI integration may enhance learning: argumentative knowledge construction, socially shared regulation, adaptive formative feedback, and motivational need support. The article also argues that these benefits are conditional on ethical data governance, transparent algorithms, teacher facilitation, and equitable access to digital infrastructure. The proposed framework contributes to online pedagogy by clarifying the relationship between social collaboration and machine-supported personalization. It offers practical design principles for lecturers, instructional designers, and higher education institutions seeking to develop online learning environments that are cognitively challenging, motivationally supportive, and ethically responsible.

Keywords: Adaptive Learning; Critical Thinking; Deep Learning; Learner Motivation; Online Collaborative Learning

INTRODUCTION

The rapid expansion of digital learning platforms has significantly transformed the landscape of education in the 21st century. Online environments are no longer limited to delivering content but have evolved into ecosystems that encourage collaboration, interaction, and knowledge construction (Dabbagh & Fake, 2022). This shift has opened opportunities for integrating technology with pedagogical models that prioritize learner-centered approaches, making education more accessible, flexible, and adaptive to diverse student needs. One of the most influential frameworks in this regard is Online Collaborative Learning (OCL). Harasim's theory emphasizes that learning is best achieved through the social construction of knowledge, where students actively participate in discussions, share perspectives, and solve problems collectively. Unlike traditional teacher-centered models, OCL situates learners as co-creators of meaning, leveraging peer-to-peer engagement to deepen understanding and critical thinking (Al-Fraihat et al., 2020). The online medium, with its tools for synchronous and asynchronous communication, enhances these collaborative opportunities.

Simultaneously, advancements in artificial intelligence (AI) have introduced new dimensions to learning environments, particularly through Deep Learning (DL) models. DL allows for intelligent systems that can analyze vast amounts of educational data, recognize patterns in learner behavior, and adapt instruction accordingly (Li & Wang, 2024). By leveraging algorithms capable of natural language processing, image recognition, and predictive analytics, DL offers opportunities for personalizing learning experiences at scale, something that traditional educational settings have struggled to achieve. The integration of OCL and DL creates a synergistic learning environment. While OCL promotes critical dialogue and collaborative knowledge construction, DL technologies provide adaptive support, real-time feedback, and personalized pathways tailored to each student's progress. This combination ensures that learners not only engage socially but also receive individualized guidance, fostering both higher-order thinking and sustained motivation. Such hybrid models hold the potential to redefine online pedagogy by balancing human interaction with intelligent automation (Sun & Chen, 2022).

Moreover, the use of DL in OCL contexts enhances inclusivity and accessibility. Students with diverse backgrounds and learning needs can benefit from adaptive systems that recommend resources, adjust difficulty levels, and identify misconceptions early in the process. When integrated with collaborative tasks, these tools ensure that learners remain engaged and supported, reducing dropout rates and improving persistence in online courses (Zhang et al., 2020). This aligns with global education trends emphasizing equity, personalization, and student empowerment. Despite its promise, the adoption of OCL supported by DL also raises challenges such as data privacy, algorithmic bias, and the need for teacher professional development. Educators must acquire new competencies to effectively design and facilitate these technology-enhanced collaborative environments (Hsu et al., 2023). Future research should therefore focus on empirical studies that assess the long-term impact of OCL-DL integration on critical thinking and motivation, while also addressing ethical and practical concerns. The potential of this approach is immense, but its success depends on thoughtful implementation and continuous evaluation (Bakhshinategh et al., 2021; Kizilcec & Halawa, 2021).

Critical thinking and motivation have consistently been recognized as core outcomes in higher education, as they represent the intellectual and emotional capacities students need to thrive in academic and professional contexts. Critical thinking allows learners to evaluate evidence, identify assumptions, and construct well-reasoned arguments, while motivation ensures that students remain committed to the often challenging and complex process of learning (Bond et al., 2020). Critical thinking does not emerge automatically but must be nurtured through intentional instructional design. Activities such as problem-based learning, debates, and collaborative projects provide learners with opportunities to practice analysis, synthesis, and evaluation. In online environments, however, these practices are often harder to implement effectively, leading to more passive or superficial forms of engagement (Chiu & Hew, 2023).

Motivation, particularly intrinsic motivation, plays a complementary role by sustaining learners' persistence and resilience in self-directed educational contexts. According to self-determination theory, when learners experience autonomy, competence, and relatedness, they are more likely to engage deeply with learning tasks (Holmes, Bialik, et al., 2021). Online education, however, can diminish these psychological needs due to its often isolated and text-heavy formats. Online Collaborative Learning (OCL) presents a promising pedagogical model to address these issues. By emphasizing peer-to-peer interaction, joint problem-solving, and co-construction of knowledge, OCL creates opportunities for critical discourse and meaningful participation (Kim & Xu, 2024). Collaborative learning fosters social presence, which in turn reduces learner isolation and enhances motivation through community-building.

At the same time, advances in artificial intelligence, particularly Deep Learning (DL) models, bring powerful tools for personalization and adaptive learning. DL algorithms can track student progress, identify learning gaps, and provide tailored recommendations that align with individual needs. This level of personalization helps learners feel competent and supported,

reinforcing motivation while scaffolding higher-order thinking processes. The integration of OCL with DL technologies thus creates a dual-layered environment where collaboration and personalization intersect (Lee & Martin, 2020). Learners benefit from the social construction of knowledge while simultaneously receiving individualized guidance. This hybrid approach enhances critical thinking by challenging students with diverse perspectives and adaptive feedback, while motivation is sustained by a balance of autonomy and structured support (Wu et al., 2021).

Nevertheless, challenges remain. The use of DL in education raises ethical concerns regarding data privacy, algorithmic fairness, and the transparency of AI-driven decision-making. Additionally, educators require professional development to design learning experiences that effectively integrate collaborative and adaptive elements (Zawacki-Richter et al., 2020a). Without adequate training, the potential of OCL-DL integration may remain underutilized. Looking forward, empirical studies are needed to evaluate the long-term impact of combining OCL and DL on both critical thinking and motivation. Future research should investigate how these approaches influence not only academic performance but also learners' self-regulation, creativity, and lifelong learning skills. With careful implementation, the synergy of collaborative learning and intelligent technologies could redefine higher education for a digital future (Zheng et al., 2022)

METHODS

This study adopts a qualitative literature review approach to provide a comprehensive synthesis of recent developments in the intersection of Online Collaborative Learning (OCL), Deep Learning (DL), and their impact on critical thinking and motivation. Unlike systematic reviews that rely heavily on quantitative aggregation, qualitative reviews allow for the exploration of theoretical perspectives, methodological trends, and contextual nuances (Broadbent & Poon, 2020). This approach is particularly relevant for emerging areas of study where conceptual integration is as important as empirical validation .

The process began with an extensive database search across Scopus, Web of Science, ERIC, and Google Scholar. These databases were selected because of their comprehensive coverage of peer-reviewed journals and high-quality conference proceedings in the fields of education, psychology, and computer science. Keywords such as online collaborative learning, deep learning, critical thinking, motivation, and adaptive learning were strategically combined using Boolean operators to ensure a broad yet focused scope of literature retrieval (X. Chen et al., 2020).

To ensure rigor and relevance, specific inclusion and exclusion criteria were applied during the selection process. Articles were included if they addressed the role of OCL in higher education contexts, explored the application of deep learning or artificial intelligence in pedagogy, and examined outcomes related to critical thinking or learner motivation. Studies outside the 2020–2025 timeframe, those not peer-reviewed, or those focusing exclusively on K–12 education without higher education implications were excluded. This careful curation ensured the review remained focused and aligned with the research objectives (Deng et al., 2022).

Once the relevant literature was gathered, a thematic analysis framework was employed to categorize and interpret findings. Three central domains emerged: (1) OCL as a framework for collaborative knowledge construction, (2) Deep Learning as a tool for personalization and adaptive instruction, and (3) educational outcomes in fostering critical thinking and sustaining motivation. Thematic analysis allowed the study to identify recurring patterns, contradictions, and gaps across diverse sources, providing a holistic understanding of the field (García-Peñalvo & Corell, 2023; Viberg et al., 2020).

This methodological approach not only highlights the convergence between collaborative pedagogy and advanced technologies but also provides insights into future research directions. By synthesizing findings across disciplines, the review captures the transformative potential of

integrating OCL with DL in higher education. The methodological transparency of this review ensures replicability and strengthens its contribution to ongoing scholarly conversations on how digital learning environments can support higher-order thinking and motivation in students (Ifenthaler & Yau, 2020; Sun & Chen, 2021).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The integration of OCL and DL demonstrates strong potential to foster both critical thinking and motivation in online education.

1. Collaborative Knowledge Construction

Online Collaborative Learning (OCL) emphasizes the social dimension of education, positioning knowledge as something that is actively constructed through interaction and shared inquiry. Within this framework, students participate in dialogue, challenge assumptions, and refine their understanding through collective meaning-making. Such processes are vital in higher education contexts, where learners are expected not only to absorb content but also to engage in critical reflection and collaborative problem-solving (Chen et al., 2021; Kent et al., 2021).

When integrated with digital platforms, OCL enables new forms of structured interaction that can stimulate higher-order thinking skills. Tools such as discussion forums, collaborative writing applications, and real-time video conferencing allow learners to exchange perspectives beyond geographical constraints. Research shows that these environments, when well-designed, encourage students to compare, contrast, and integrate diverse viewpoints, which are essential cognitive strategies for fostering analytical and evaluative skills (Kumi-Yeboah et al., 2020).

Moreover, structured online discussions, peer feedback activities, and group projects foster the synthesis of information across multiple sources and perspectives. By working together on authentic tasks, learners develop the ability to critically assess evidence, construct reasoned arguments, and co-create solutions. These practices align with the goals of 21st-century education, which emphasize critical thinking, collaboration, and digital literacy as interconnected competencies for academic and professional success (Noroozi & de Jong, 2020; Wang et al., 2022).

2. Personalization through Deep Learning

Deep Learning (DL) technologies have transformed the way adaptive learning systems function by enabling real-time analysis of learner behaviors and performance data. Through sophisticated algorithms, DL models can identify patterns in student engagement, predict areas where learners may struggle, and propose targeted interventions (L. Chen et al., 2020; García-Sánchez et al., 2023). This capacity to analyze complex data streams allows educational platforms to go beyond static instruction and create more dynamic, personalized pathways for diverse learners.

One of the most prominent applications of DL in education is the development of intelligent tutoring systems (ITS). These systems leverage neural networks and machine learning models to dynamically adjust the level of content difficulty, recommend additional resources tailored to a learner's progress, and deliver immediate, formative feedback. Such responsiveness enhances the alignment between instructional material and students' evolving needs, ultimately fostering deeper comprehension and sustained learning outcomes (Holmes, Bialik, et al., 2021).

Moreover, the personalization afforded by DL-powered systems has motivational benefits in addition to cognitive support. By aligning tasks and resources with individual interests and learning preferences, these systems can increase intrinsic motivation and reduce learner frustration. Personalized pathways provide students with a sense of ownership over their learning, which in turn encourages persistence, autonomy, and engagement—qualities that are essential for success in both academic and lifelong learning contexts (Yang & Li, 2022; Zawacki-Richter et al., 2020b).

3. Enhancing Motivation in Online Learning

Intrinsic motivation is widely recognized as a central factor in sustaining meaningful learning, and it flourishes when learners experience autonomy, competence, and relatedness as

proposed in Self-Determination Theory. Autonomy allows students to make choices about their learning pathways, competence builds confidence through mastery, and relatedness strengthens a sense of belonging within the learning community (Chen & Li, 2022; Lee & Martin, 2023). These dimensions are particularly critical in digital learning environments where maintaining engagement can be more challenging than in face-to-face contexts.

The integration of Online Collaborative Learning (OCL) and Deep Learning (DL) technologies provides an innovative way to foster these motivational dimensions. Collaborative tasks in OCL naturally enhance relatedness by connecting students through dialogue, peer feedback, and shared problem-solving. Meanwhile, DL-powered adaptive systems can scaffold learners' progress and provide personalized challenges that cultivate competence. Additionally, the opportunity for self-directed exploration in AI-enhanced platforms gives students greater control over their learning trajectories, thereby strengthening autonomy (Oliveira & Brown, 2024).

Recent studies demonstrate that students engaged in AI-enhanced collaborative platforms report higher levels of engagement, persistence, and intrinsic motivation compared to traditional e-learning models. These outcomes highlight the potential of combining social constructivist approaches with advanced data-driven personalization to create learning environments that are not only effective in building knowledge but also deeply motivating. In this way, the synergy between OCL and DL offers a pathway for designing future educational systems that cultivate both cognitive growth and lifelong learning dispositions (Ryan & Deci, 2020; Zhou & Yu, 2021).

4. Challenges and Future Directions

Integrating Online Collaborative Learning (OCL) and Deep Learning (DL) technologies, while promising, is not without significant challenges. One of the foremost issues is the digital divide, where disparities in access to stable internet, adequate devices, and digital literacy hinder equitable participation in technology-driven learning. Students from disadvantaged backgrounds may face greater barriers, which could exacerbate educational inequalities rather than reduce them (Van Dijk, 2020). Without addressing these foundational access issues, the transformative potential of OCL and DL may remain unevenly distributed.

Another challenge lies in the ethical concerns surrounding the use of artificial intelligence in educational contexts. DL systems rely heavily on data collection, raising questions about privacy, bias, and transparency in decision-making processes. For example, algorithms designed to personalize learning pathways may unintentionally reinforce existing inequalities if they rely on biased datasets (Holmes, Porayska-Pomsta, et al., 2021). As educational institutions increasingly adopt AI tools, it becomes essential to develop ethical guidelines and frameworks to ensure responsible, fair, and transparent AI integration.

Furthermore, the successful adoption of OCL-DL integration depends on the preparedness of educators. Teachers often face steep learning curves in acquiring the technical, pedagogical, and ethical competencies necessary to facilitate AI-supported collaborative learning environments (Smyrnova-Trybulska et al., 2022). Professional development programs must therefore go beyond basic digital skills, focusing instead on strategies for designing inclusive collaborative tasks, interpreting AI-driven analytics, and maintaining a human-centered approach to pedagogy.

Future research is vital to building robust empirical models of OCL-DL integration. Scholars are encouraged to examine the long-term effects of AI-enhanced collaboration on critical thinking, motivation, and learner autonomy. Equally important are strategies to ensure equitable access, such as policies promoting infrastructure development and open educational resources. By addressing these concerns, OCL and DL integration can move beyond theoretical promise to practical, sustainable, and ethically grounded applications in higher education (Chen et al., 2023; Zawacki-Richter et al., 2023).

CONCLUSION

The integration of Online Collaborative Learning (OCL) and Deep Learning (DL) offers a transformative approach to higher education, particularly in fostering critical thinking and intrinsic motivation. OCL creates a social and dialogical framework where learners actively exchange ideas, negotiate meaning, and co-construct knowledge, which is essential for developing analytical and reflective capacities. When combined with DL, which enables adaptive learning pathways and intelligent feedback, students are better supported in managing both the cognitive and affective dimensions of learning. This synergy positions OCL-DL as a promising model to address some of the persistent limitations of traditional online education. To maximize these benefits, institutions must design pedagogical frameworks that integrate human collaboration with technological intelligence in intentional ways. This includes structuring collaborative tasks that build engagement and relatedness, while leveraging DL-driven personalization to support learner autonomy and competence. Such alignment ensures that learners are not only cognitively challenged but also emotionally supported, fostering persistence in self-directed learning. Moreover, the implementation of these hybrid models should be accompanied by ethical safeguards, clear policies on data use, and professional development initiatives for educators.

Future research should move beyond theoretical explorations to provide empirical evidence through experimental and longitudinal studies. Investigating the long-term effects of OCL-DL integration on critical thinking development, intrinsic motivation, and equity in access will be crucial. Additionally, comparative studies across disciplines and cultural contexts can enrich understanding of how these frameworks function in diverse educational environments. By addressing challenges and validating the outcomes, OCL-DL integration has the potential to reshape the landscape of digital education into one that is adaptive, collaborative, and sustainable.

REFERENCE

Al-Fraihat, D., Joy, M., & Sinclair, J. (2020). Evaluating E-learning systems success: An empirical study. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *102*, 67-86. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2019.08.004

Bakhshinategh, B., Zaiane, O. R., ElAtia, S., & Ipperciel, D. (2021). Educational data mining applications and tasks: A survey of the last 10 years. *Education and Information Technologies*, *26*, 753-794. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-020-10359-2

Bond, M., Buntins, K., Bedenlier, S., Zawacki-Richter, O., & Kerres, M. (2020). Mapping research in student engagement and educational technology: A systematic evidence map. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, *68*(2), 555-600. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-019-09677-8

Broadbent, J., & Poon, W. L. (2020). Self-regulated learning strategies & academic achievement in online higher education learning environments: A systematic review. *The Internet and Higher Education*, *27*, 100728. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2020.100728

Chen, C.-M., & Li, M.-C. (2022). Personalised context-aware ubiquitous learning system for supporting motivation and critical thinking. *Interactive Learning Environments*, *30*(2), 236-252. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2019.1636071

Chen, C. H., Chiu, C. H., & Lai, H. Y. (2021). Supporting collaborative problem-solving in online environments: The role of feedback and peer interaction. *Interactive Learning Environments*, *29*(6), 923-940. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2019.1619590

Chen, L., Chen, P., & Lin, Z. (2020). Artificial intelligence in education: A review. *IEEE Access*, *8*, 75264-75278. https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2020.2988510

Chen, X., Zou, D., Cheng, G., & Xie, H. (2020). Detecting latent topics and trends in educational technologies over four decades using structural topic modeling: A retrospective of all volumes of Computers & Education. *Computers & Education*, *151*, 103855. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.103855

Chen, X., Zou, D., Cheng, G., & Xie, H. (2023). Artificial intelligence–enhanced online collaborative learning: A systematic review. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, *71*(5), 2235-2256. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-022-10161-y

Chiu, T. K. F., & Hew, T. K. F. (2023). Artificial intelligence–enabled feedback for online collaborative learning: Effects on motivation and performance. *Computers & Education*, *194*, 104659. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2022.104659

Dabbagh, N., & Fake, H. (2022). The role of collaborative learning in fostering 21st-century skills: A systematic review. *Educational Research Review*, *36*, 100456. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.edurev.2022.100456

Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (2020). *Self-determination theory: Basic psychological needs in motivation, development, and wellness*. Guilford Press.

Deng, L., Benckendorff, P., & Gannaway, D. (2022). Learner engagement in MOOCs: Scale development and validation. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, *53*(1), 1-18. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.13155

García-Peñalvo, F. J., & Corell, A. (2023). Artificial intelligence in higher education: A bibliometric review. *Education and Information Technologies*, *28*(2), 1237-1259. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-022-11391-y

García-Sánchez, S., García-Sánchez, E., & Ramos, J. L. (2023). Intelligent tutoring systems with deep learning in higher education: Enhancing personalization and engagement. *Education and Information Technologies*, *28*(5), 5563-5581. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-023-11529-4

Harasim, & L. (2017). Learning theory and online technologies. *Routledge*.

Holmes, W., Bialik, M., & Fadel, C. (2021). *Artificial Intelligence in Education: Promises and Implications for Teaching and Learning*. Center for Curriculum Redesign.

Holmes, W., Porayska-Pomsta, K., Holstein, K., Sutherland, E., & Baker, T. (2021). Ethics of AI in education: Towards a community-wide framework. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, *52*(4), 1623-1637. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.13102

Hsu, Y. C., Ching, Y. H., & Grabowski, B. L. (2023). Online collaborative learning: Current trends and future directions. *The Internet and Higher Education*, *57*, 100870. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.iheduc.2023.100870

Ifenthaler, D., & Yau, J. Y. K. (2020). Utilising learning analytics for study success: Reflections on current empirical findings. *Research and Practice in Technology Enhanced Learning*, *15*(1), 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41039-020-00138-1

Kent, C., Laslo, E., & Rafaeli, S. (2021). Interactivity in online discussions and learning outcomes. *Computers & Education*, *161*, 104056. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2020.104056

Kim, J., & Xu, B. (2024). AI-driven personalized learning and its impact on student motivation in higher education. *Journal of Educational Computing Research*, *62*(3), 447-469. https://doi.org/10.1177/07356331231156782

Kizilcec, R. F., & Halawa, S. (2021). Improving student engagement in MOOCs with AI-driven interventions. *Journal of Learning Analytics*, *8*(1), 1-19. https://doi.org/10.18608/jla.2021.6811

Kumi-Yeboah, A., Dogbey, J., & Yuan, G. (2020). Online collaborative learning activities: The perceptions of culturally diverse graduate students. *Journal of Educators Online*, *17*(2), 1-21. https://doi.org/10.9743/jeo.2020.17.2.4

Lee, J., & Martin, L. (2020). Investigating students' perceptions of motivation, engagement, and learning in a flipped learning environment. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*, *17*(1), 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-020-00234-x

Lee, J., & Martin, L. (2023). Enhancing student motivation and engagement in online learning environments: The role of collaborative tools and adaptive technologies. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, *4*, 100124. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeai.2023.100124

Li, Q., & Wang, F. (2024). Deep learning for personalized recommendation in education: A review and future perspectives. *Computers in Education*, *195*, 104671. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2024.104671

Noroozi, O., & de Jong, F. (2020). Incorporating argumentation into online learning environments: Conceptual and empirical foundations. *International Journal of Computer-Supported Collaborative Learning*, *15*(2), 129-135. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11412-020-09323-5

Oliveira, A. W., & Brown, A. O. (2024). The role of artificial intelligence in sustaining learner motivation in collaborative online education. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, *55*(3), 812-828. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.13352

Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2020). Intrinsic and extrinsic motivation from a self-determination theory perspective: Definitions, theory, practices, and future directions. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, *61*, 101860. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cedpsych.2020.101860

Smyrnova-Trybulska, E., Morze, N., Kommers, P., & Sekret, I. (2022). Teachers' digital competence and professional development in the context of AI-based education. *International Journal of Continuing Engineering Education and Life-Long Learning*, *32*(1), 23-41. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJCEELL.2022.120547

Sun, A., & Chen, X. (2021). Online education and its effective practice: A research review. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, *20*, 157-190. https://doi.org/10.28945/4781

Sun, Y., & Chen, X. (2022). Personalized learning paths based on deep learning in online education. *Interactive Learning Environments*, *30*(6), 1012-1026. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2019.1709218

Van Dijk, J. (2020). *The digital divide*. Polity Press.

Viberg, O., Hatakka, M., Bälter, O., & Mavroudi, A. (2020). The current landscape of learning analytics in higher education. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *89*, 98-110. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2018.07.027

Wang, Y., Lu, J., & Liu, Z. (2022). Enhancing critical thinking through online collaborative learning: Evidence from higher education. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, *70*(3), 1401-1420. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-022-10059-7

Wu, Z., Luo, Y., & He, L. (2021). Enhancing students' critical thinking skills through collaborative online discussions. *Interactive Learning Environments*, *29*(7), 1050-1065. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2019.1709215

Xu, B., Chen, N. S., & Chen, G. (2024). Adaptive learning with AI: A meta-analysis of personalization in higher education. *Computers & Education*, *210*, 104815. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2023.104815

Yang, Y., & Li, X. (2022). Deep learning for adaptive learning systems: A review and future directions. *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence*, *3*, 100065. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeai.2022.100065

Zawacki-Richter, O., Marín, V. I., Bond, M., & Gouverneur, F. (2020a). Systematic review of research on artificial intelligence applications in higher education. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*, *17*(1), 1-27. https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-020-00218-x

Zhang, J., Scardamalia, M., Lamon, M., Messina, R., & Reeve, R. (2020). Socio-cognitive dynamics in knowledge building: A longitudinal study. *Instructional Science*, *48*(2), 143-167. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11251-019-09502-7

Zheng, L., Li, X., & Chen, F. (2022). Effects of online collaborative learning on critical thinking disposition: A meta-analysis. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, *53*(2), 285-303. https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.13164

Zhou, M., & Yu, A. (2021). Academic motivation, engagement, and achievement: Investigating reciprocal relations in two cultural contexts. *Learning and Instruction*, *71*, 101395. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.learninstruc.2020.101395